

YÜKSEKÖĞRETİM ORTAMLARINDA PEDAGOJİYİ GELİŞTİRMEK İÇİN HİBRİD ÖĞRENME YAKLAŞIMLARININ ENTEGRE EDİLMESİ

Zohaib Hassan SAIN*

Aulia Luqman AZIZ

Makale İlk Gönderim Tarihi / Recieved (First): 18.11.2023 Makale Kabul Tarihi 26.12.2023

Atıf/©: Sain, Z. H. ve Aziz, A. L.. (2023). Yükseköğretim ortamlarında pedagojiyi geliştirmek için hibrit öğrenme yaklaşımlarının entegrasyonu. . *Journal of Advancements in Education*, 1(1), 37-49.

Özet

Hibrit öğrenme, dünya genelinde yükseköğretim kurumlarının çeşitli gereksinimlerine yönelik bir zorunlu yanıt olarak ortaya çıkmıştır. Bu yeni strateji, geleneksel sınıf tekniklerini çevrimiçi bileşenlerle birleştirerek, yüz yüze öğretim ve elektronik öğrenmenin avantajlarını bir araya getirmektedir. Bu çalışmanın amacı, Hibrit Öğrenme yöntemlerinin Pakistan'daki Yükseköğretim Kurumları'ndaki öğretim yöntemlerine ne kadar entegre edildiğini değerlendirmektir. Bir açıklayıcı ardışık model ile çok yönlü bir süreç kullanılarak, araştırma özellikle kamu üniversitelerinden eğitimcileri kapsayan kapsamlı bir örnekleme prosedürü ile yürütülmüştür. Anketler ve mülakatlar gibi temel veri toplama araçları kullanılarak, araştırma öğretmenler arasında teknolojinin pedagojiye entegrasyonuna karşı olumlu bir eğilim ortaya koymaktadır. Özellikle, eğitimcilerin çoğunluğunun çeşitli yazılım uygulamalarında yetenekli olduğunu ve internet becerilerine sahip olduğunu göstermektedir. Bununla birlikte, araştırma, bu olumlu bakış açısına rağmen üniversitelerin hibrit öğrenme uygulaması konusunda hala erken aşamalarda olduğunu vurgulamaktadır. Sonuç, hibrit öğrenmenin daha etkili bir şekilde benimsenmesini kolaylaştırmak için ortak çabaların gerekliliğini vurgular ve üniversitelerin sorunsuz ders uygulaması için ek bilişim altyapısı sağlama konusundaki zorunlu rolünü vurgular. Araştırma, entegrasyonun kapsamlı ve iyi tanımlanmış olması için hibrit öğrenmenin üniversitelerin stratejik planlarına açıkça dahil edilmesini savunmaktadır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Eğitim Altyapısı, Hibrit Öğrenme, Pedagojik İnovasyon, Teknoloji Entegrasyonu. Yükseköğretim

INTEGRATING HYBRID LEARNING APPROACHES FOR ENHANCED PEDAGOGY IN HIGHER EDUCATION SETTINGS

Zohaib Hassan SAIN^{1*}

Aulia Luqman AZIZ²

Received (First): 17.10.2023

Accepted: 27.12.2023

Citation/©: Sain, Z. H., & Aziz, A. L. (2023). *Integrating hybrid learning approaches for enhanced pedagogy in higher education settings. Journal of Advancements in Education, 1(1), 37-49.*

Abstract

Blended learning has emerged globally as an imperative response to the diverse requirements of higher education institutions. This novel strategy integrates conventional classroom techniques with online components, leveraging the advantages of both in-person instruction and electronic learning. The objective of this study is to assess the degree to which blended learning is incorporated into the instructional methods of Higher Education Institutions (HEIs) in Pakistan. Utilizing a multi-methodology process with an explanatory sequential model, the research specifically targets educators from public universities through an exhaustive sampling procedure. Utilizing questionnaires and interviews as primary data collection tools, the research underscores a positive inclination among teachers toward the incorporation of technology in pedagogy. Notably, the majority of educators demonstrate proficiency in various software applications and possess adept internet skills. However, the study highlights that despite this positive outlook, universities are still in the early stages of awareness regarding blended learning implementation. The conclusion underscores the need for concerted efforts to facilitate a more effective adoption of blended learning, emphasizing the imperative role of universities in providing additional computing infrastructure for seamless course execution. The research advocates for the explicit inclusion of blended learning in universities' strategic plans to ensure comprehensive and well-defined integration.

Keywords: Blended Learning, Educational Infrastructure, Higher Education, Pedagogical Innovation, Technology Integration

1. INTRODUCTION

The evolution of higher education in the era of globalization has positioned universities as crucial research centers, influencing both national development and international prominence. As universities increasingly contribute to economic growth through advancements in science, technology, and modern programs, the imperative to prepare students for the challenges of the digital age has become paramount. In the 21st century, technology integration has become vital across various sectors, particularly in higher education, marking a transformative paradigm shift (Kok, 2010). Developed nations have experienced a profound transformation in education, with the technological revolution driving innovations in higher education, notably through the implementation of blended learning (Alebaikan, 2010; Tshabalala et al., 2014).

Blended learning, a thriving concept in developed nations, has introduced rapid and innovative systems in educational institutions, pushing boundaries and bringing about improvements for

¹ Zohaib Hassan Sain, Superior University, zohaib3746@gmail.com and Orcid no: 0000-0001-6567-5963, *corresponding author

² Aulia Luqman AZIZ, Universitas Brawijaya, aualuqmanaziz@ub.ac.id and Orcid no: 0000-0002-0017-433X

knowledge seekers (Kistow, 2011; Young, 2002). This approach involves combining traditional classroom methods with online platforms, reducing reliance on lecture-based teaching and printed materials (King & Arnold, 2009). Blended learning encourages innovation, flexibility, activeness, and collaboration in the teaching-learning process, providing students with the freedom to access online platforms anytime, anywhere (Singh, 2003). It has also given rise to a unique model for peer-to-peer and peer-to-school interaction, contributing to reduced costs in higher education.

In Pakistan, similar to other South Asian countries, there has been a slow adoption of technology in education. Allama Iqbal Open University (AIU) introduced e-learning in 2000 under the framework of the Open Learning Institute of Virtual Education. The Virtual University (VU) of Pakistan initiated courses through ICT and national TV channels. Despite these pioneering efforts, other public and professional universities in Pakistan have been relatively slow to fully embrace advanced technology systems, especially in the context of blended learning.

Recognizing the transformative potential of technology, the Higher Education Commission (HEC) in Pakistan has undertaken commendable initiatives to introduce and promote innovative technology in higher educational institutions. These initiatives include Online Lecturing and Net-Meeting using IP-Based Video Conferencing Systems, Broadband Facilities, the National Digital Library, and the Pakistan Education and Research Network. However, despite these efforts, the adoption of blended learning in developing countries like Pakistan faces several challenges.

Key challenges include issues related to ICT penetration, computer literacy barriers, reluctance to move away from traditional learning methods, electrical power failures, and English language barriers. The successful integration of blended learning in these countries depends on the persistent presence of factors conducive to its adaptation in higher education institutes. Overcoming these challenges requires a multi-faceted approach addressing infrastructure development, faculty and student education programs, and strategic planning at the institutional level. In conclusion, while the global landscape has witnessed the successful integration of blended learning in higher education, developing countries like Pakistan are navigating challenges that necessitate focused interventions. The commitment of institutions, coupled with support from governmental bodies and the private sector, is crucial for overcoming these hurdles and ensuring that the benefits of blended learning are accessible to students across diverse academic contexts.

2. RELATED LITERATURE

Blended learning, an educational approach that combines traditional classroom methods with online components, has garnered global recognition as an innovative response to the changing landscape of higher education. The literature spanning from 2004 to 2023 reflects a consensus on the transformative potential of blended learning, highlighting its capacity to leverage the advantages of both face-to-face instruction and e-learning. Scholars like Welker and Berardino (2005) and Johnson et al. (2018) emphasize the increased flexibility, engagement, and collaboration facilitated by blended learning, positioning it as a strategic tool for adapting to the demands of the digital era. As per scholarly sources, the integration of technology into teaching methods is now indispensable for higher education institutions worldwide, especially in developed nations. As indicated by Clark and Mayer (2023) and Garrison and Vaughan (2008), shifts in technology have transformed the educational landscape, with blended learning serving as a catalyst for swift and innovative educational systems. The literature highlights a fundamental shift in developed countries, where blended learning has not only diminished dependence on

traditional lecture-based teaching but has also significantly elevated the overall quality of the teaching-learning process.

Although the advantages of blended learning are well-documented in developed nations, scholarly works also point out the distinct challenges encountered by developing countries, such as Pakistan. Study conducted by Nawaz and colleagues (2004) suggest that, despite initial progress in integrating e-learning, numerous developing countries, Pakistan included, are still struggling with the effective integration of advanced technology systems, especially within the framework of blended learning. This underscores the importance of acquiring a thorough understanding of the factors that shape the implementation of blended learning in these contexts.

In the Pakistani context, the literature indicates a relatively initial phase of awareness regarding the implementation of blended learning in higher education institutions. The literature also underscores the role of educational authorities in facilitating the shift to blended learning. Endeavours by the Higher Education Commission (HEC) Pakistan, as outlined in the research by Zia et al. (2023), demonstrate initiatives to introduce and encourage the use of modern technology in higher educational institutions. Nevertheless, scholar work, e.g., Kok (2010), acknowledge persistent challenges such as issues related to ICT penetration, obstacles in computer literacy, and the reluctance to deviate from conventional learning methods. These elements emphasize the necessity of thoroughly examining the overall environment and the preparedness of higher education institutions for the all-encompassing integration of blended learning.

3. METHODOLOGY

This study focuses on a significant research issue concerning the integration of blended learning in Pakistani higher education, particularly within public universities. Despite the global recognition of blended learning as an innovative educational approach, the research aims to evaluate its actual implementation in the teaching processes of Pakistani higher education. Through a mixed-methods approach involving questionnaires and interviews with educators, the study directly collects data. The findings reveal a positive attitude among teachers towards integrating technology into pedagogy, showcasing their proficiency in various software applications. However, a crucial discovery indicates that Pakistani universities are still in the early stages of awareness regarding the implementation of blended learning.

The primary research issue emphasizes the necessity for concerted efforts to promote a more effective adoption of blended learning in Pakistani higher education institutions. The study underscores the pivotal role of universities in this process, advocating for additional computing infrastructure to ensure the seamless execution of courses utilizing blended learning methodologies. Recognizing the importance of supportive technological infrastructure aligns with the broader goal of enhancing the overall educational experience for both educators and students. The research issue not only highlights the current state of blended learning in Pakistani higher education but also stresses the need for strategic and coordinated initiatives. The study recommends a more explicit inclusion of blended learning in the long-term plans of universities, acknowledging it as a vital component for comprehensive and well-defined integration. By addressing these aspects, the research contributes not only to the academic discourse on blended learning but also to the practical considerations that can bring transformative changes to the educational landscape of Pakistani higher education institutions.

3.1. Significance of the Study

This study plays a pivotal role in offering insights into the current status of blended learning integration within Pakistani higher education, specifically focusing on its implementation in teaching processes at public universities. The research provides valuable perspectives on the challenges and opportunities faced by educators and institutions. The assessment of the adoption of blended learning contributes to a deeper understanding of the readiness of Pakistani higher education for innovative teaching methodologies. The study's emphasis on evaluating teachers' awareness and proficiency in using technology is noteworthy, offering valuable information about educators' preparedness to fully incorporate blended learning into their teaching practices. This comprehension is crucial for identifying areas that may require additional support and training, facilitating a smoother transition to blended learning.

Moreover, the research findings can serve as a guide for policymakers, educational administrators, and faculty members. By highlighting existing gaps and potential benefits associated with enhanced technology integration, the study informs strategic planning and decision-making processes. The call for concerted efforts to promote a more effective adoption of blended learning underscores the need for long-term educational strategies explicitly including this innovative approach in Pakistani higher education. Ultimately, the significance of this study lies in its potential to guide educational stakeholders toward fostering a technologically advanced and student-centric learning environment. By addressing identified challenges and leveraging opportunities, the research advocates for a transformative shift in the educational landscape of Pakistani higher education institutions, aligning them more closely with contemporary pedagogical advancements.

3.2. Research Design

The research study employed the explanatory sequential design, a mixed-method approach commonly known as the two-phase model (Creswell, 2013). This model involves the initial collection of quantitative data, followed by the collection of qualitative data to provide an explanatory context for the quantitative results. By adopting this approach, the study aimed to offer a comprehensive understanding of the research problem concerning blended learning integration in public sector general universities in Lahore.

3.3. Participants of the Study

The participant size for the concluded study was carefully determined, incorporating a mix of male and female teachers along with student perspectives. The sample for this study encompassed all six public sector general universities in Lahore. To ensure diversity, two departments from each Faculty of Social Sciences and Business Management were purposefully selected from each university. Subsequently, 130 teachers (70 males, 60 females) from the chosen departments were randomly selected to participate in the study. The utilization of this purposive and random sampling technique aimed to capture a representative view of the perspectives of university teachers on blended learning.

3.4. Data Collection and Data Analysis

A five-point Likert scale, ranging from strongly agree to strongly disagree (1= Strongly Agree (SA), 2= Agree (A), 3= Undecided (UD), 4= Disagree (DA), 5= Strongly Disagree (SDA)), was employed for the quantitative questionnaire. The questionnaire, specifically designed for

university teachers, was administered to a total of 130 respondents. This comprised 70 male teachers and 60 female teachers, ensuring a gender-inclusive representation.

Furthermore, to gain insights into the student perspective on blended learning, feedback was sought from 350 students through a separate questionnaire. The student questionnaire aimed to capture diverse opinions on the effectiveness and challenges associated with blended learning. Out of the 70 male teachers approached, 50 provided responses, and out of the 60 female teachers, 33 participated, contributing to a comprehensive understanding of the attitudes and perceptions of both male and female educators.

To supplement the quantitative data with richer qualitative insights, two teachers were randomly selected from each of the six departments of the selected universities. These 12 teachers participated in qualitative data collection through an interview protocol. The qualitative component of the study sought to delve deeper into the experiences, challenges, and recommendations of teachers regarding the integration of blended learning in higher education.

The use of both quantitative and qualitative data collection methods, along with a diverse participant pool, enhances the study's validity and provides a well-rounded understanding of the current state of blended learning integration in public sector general universities in Lahore. The findings from this research are expected to contribute valuable insights to the ongoing discourse on the implementation of blended learning in higher education settings. Table 1 shows the concluded study participant size as below:

Table 1: Concluded Study Participant Size

Universities	Teachers (Interviews)		Teachers (Questionnaire)		Students (Questionnaire)	
	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female
University A	1	1	6	4	35	30
University B	1	1	7	5	30	22
University C	1	1	11	7	28	19
University D	1	1	8	3	41	28
University E	1	1	13	6	37	27
University F	1	1	5	8	29	24
Total Sample	6	6	50	33	200	150

3.3. Research Objectives

This research aimed to:

- Assess the level of integration of blended learning in the instructional methodologies of Higher Education Institutions.

- Recognize and examine the fundamental issues and obstacles encountered by Higher Education Institutions in the execution of blended learning within their teaching processes.

The research question are as follows:

- What are the key difficulties and hurdles experienced by Higher Education Institutions when incorporating blended learning into their teaching processes?
- To what degree has the implementation of blended learning progressed in the teaching procedures of Higher Education Institutions?

4. FINDINGS

The research findings from the study conducted on blended learning integration in Pakistani higher education settings revealed several noteworthy insights. Applying the explanatory sequential design through a multi-methodology approach, the investigation incorporated a combination of quantitative and qualitative data gathering methods to thoroughly investigate the research inquiries.

The examination concentrated on six general public universities in Lahore, choosing two departments from both the Faculties of Social Sciences and Business Management. Teachers were randomly sampled, and a five-point Likert scale questionnaire was administered, garnering responses from 70 male and 28 female teachers. Additionally, feedback on blended learning was obtained from 350 students.

The quantitative data collected from the survey of 70 male and 28 female teachers, along with responses from 350 students, revealed a positive inclination towards the integration of technology into pedagogy. The majority of teachers exhibited proficiency in various software applications, indicating a readiness for technology adoption. However, the analysis also pointed out a limited awareness among universities regarding blended learning implementation, suggesting a disparity between teachers' readiness and institutional preparedness. To further validate the quantitative findings, a statistical analysis was conducted. The results indicated a statistically significant positive correlation between teachers' proficiency in software applications and their inclination towards integrating technology into pedagogy ($p < 0.05$). This suggests that as teachers' proficiency in software applications increases, so does their positive attitude towards blended learning.

Qualitative data, collected through interviews with randomly selected teachers, provided deeper insights into the challenges faced. The qualitative findings reiterated the need for comprehensive strategies to bridge the awareness gap and facilitate effective blended learning adoption. Challenges identified included inadequate computing infrastructure and a lack of explicit inclusion of blended learning in institutional strategic plans. The following are some of the quotes from the participants supporting these ideas:

"While technology isn't a cure-all for educational challenges, it possesses the potential to play a significant role in addressing them" (P4).

"The key aspect of technology in education lies in its ability to empower individuals, providing access to information, facilitating communication, and fostering collaboration" (P9).

"The emphasis should not solely be on the technology itself. Instead, the focus should be on the sharing of knowledge, efficient communication, the establishment of learning communities, and the cultivation of a professional culture within educational institutions" (P11).

The responses from a sample of 350 students mirrored the favourable attitude noted among educators, highlighting the advantages of blended learning, including flexibility and ease of access. However, students also expressed concerns about the need for additional support and resources to fully engage with blended learning. A sample quote supporting this finding is as follows:

"We recognize the potential, but to fully engage and succeed, we're looking for additional support and tools that can enhance our learning experience" (P5).

In summary, the findings highlight the existing positive attitude among teachers and students toward blended learning. Nevertheless, the research emphasizes the necessity for universities to tackle issues associated with awareness, infrastructure, and strategic planning, ensuring a smooth and efficient incorporation of blended learning in the higher education landscape of Pakistan. The discussion delves into potential strategies for overcoming these challenges and emphasizes the importance of collaborative efforts among stakeholders to promote a technologically advanced and student-centric learning environment.

5. DISCUSSION

5.1. Key Difficulties

Research Question 1 asked the key difficulties and hurdles experienced by Higher Education Institutions when incorporating blended learning into their teaching processes. Findings based on the students and teachers' viewpoint aligned with the existing literature.

Firstly, faculty and staff resisted adopting new teaching methods and technologies, especially if they have been using traditional methods for a long time. Cultural resistance within the institution can be a significant barrier to the successful implementation of blended learning (Graham et al., 2013; Qureshi, 2012). Results from the study revealed that faculty and staff exhibited resistance to the adoption of new teaching methods and technologies, particularly if they had a longstanding reliance on traditional approaches. This aligns with findings in the literature, where Graham et al. (2013) and Qureshi (2012) have previously highlighted cultural resistance within institutions as a substantial barrier to the successful implementation of blended learning.

Moreover, many educators lacked the necessary skills and training to effectively use technology in their teaching, as noted in Qureshi (2012). Institutions often face challenges in providing ongoing professional development to keep faculty members updated on the latest tools and methodologies. Furthermore, the study identified that inadequate technology infrastructure, encompassing issues like insufficient Wi-Fi coverage, outdated hardware, and limited access to computers, posed challenges to the seamless integration of blended learning. This finding corresponds with the literature, especially the work of Qureshi (2012), which emphasizes the hindrances caused by insufficient technological resources. Moreover, the study observed that many educators lacked the necessary skills and training to effectively utilize technology in their teaching, a sentiment echoed by Qureshi's (2012) research. The literature further supports these findings, indicating that institutions often struggle to provide continuous professional development opportunities to keep faculty members abreast of the latest tools and methodologies

required for effective blended learning implementation. In summary, the study's results on faculty resistance and technological challenges align with existing literature, emphasizing the importance of addressing cultural barriers and enhancing technological infrastructure and educator skills for successful blended learning integration.

Furthermore, adapting existing courses to a blended format requires significant time and effort. Faculty may need to redesign curriculum, create digital content, and rethink assessment strategies. Confirming earlier literature, ensuring consistency in content delivery between the online and in-person components can be challenging (Clark & Mayer, 2023; Garrison & Vaughan, 2008).

Also, students may not be adequately prepared for the shift to blended learning, lacking the digital literacy skills necessary to navigate online platforms and engage with digital content effectively. Variability in students' access to technology and internet connectivity can create disparities in learning experiences as in Garrison and Vaughan (2008) and Graham and colleagues (2013).

Maintaining the quality of education in a blended learning environment is also crucial. Ensuring that online components are as effective as traditional methods and that learning outcomes are achieved can be challenging. This is also connected to the resources and financial management (Morgan, 2002). Allocating resources, both financial and human, for the development and maintenance of online platforms, training programs, and technical support can be a barrier, especially for institutions with limited budgets.

Determining how to assess and evaluate student performance in a blended learning environment can be challenging. Traditional assessment methods may need to be adapted, and new approaches may need to be developed (Aydemir & Saralar-Aras, 2021; Garrison & Vaughan, 2008). The lack of standardized practices and guidelines for blended learning can create inconsistencies across courses and programs within an institution (Graham et al., 2013).

Managing and safeguarding sensitive student data in online platforms are critical concerns. As previously suggested, institutions must address issues related to data security and privacy to ensure compliance with regulations (Clark & Mayer, 2023). Lastly, ensuring the sustainability of blended learning initiatives over the long term can be challenging, especially if they are dependent on temporary funding or external support (Garrison & Vaughan, 2008; Hentea et al., 2006).

Successfully addressing these challenges requires a comprehensive approach that involves faculty development, investment in infrastructure, and strategic planning at the institutional level.

5.2. The Degree of Implementation

Research Question 2 asked the degree of the implementation of blended learning progressed in the teaching procedures of Higher Education Institutions. Many institutions around the world have been actively incorporating blended learning into their teaching procedures. However, the degree of implementation varied significantly based on several factors, including geographic location, institutional priorities, and the level of resources available. General observations regarding the progress of blended learning implementation included the following points.

Blended learning has gained traction globally, with institutions recognizing its potential to enhance student engagement, flexibility, and access to educational resources. Garrison and Vaughan (2008) emphasize the transformative impact of blended learning, highlighting its ability to leverage the advantages of both face-to-face instruction and e-learning. Institutions worldwide have increasingly adopted blended learning models to create dynamic and interactive learning

environments that cater to the diverse needs of students, fostering greater engagement and flexibility in the educational experience.

Adoption rates of blended learning vary significantly among institutions, reflecting a spectrum of readiness and experimentation. Graham et al. (2013) underscores this diversity, noting that some institutions have fully embraced blended learning, recognizing its potential for enhancing educational delivery, while others are in the early stages of experimentation or implementation. Factors such as institutional culture, leadership support, and resource availability contribute to the variability in the adoption of blended learning across the higher education landscape.

Some disciplines may be more conducive to blended learning than others. For example, fields that benefit from hands-on or experiential learning may face additional challenges in implementing online components (Clark & Mayer, 2023; Young, 2002).

Advances in educational technology, including learning management systems (LMS), video conferencing tools, and interactive online content, have facilitated the implementation of blended learning. The integration of these technologies has enabled institutions to create engaging and interactive learning experiences that combine both traditional and online elements (Garrison & Vaughan, 2008; Aydemir & Saralar-Aras, 2021).

The COVID-19 pandemic has accelerated the adoption of online and blended learning models due to the need for remote education. Institutions that were previously hesitant to embrace these approaches have had to adapt quickly to ensure continuity in education. This unprecedented situation has underscored the importance of flexible and resilient learning models, prompting institutions worldwide to reevaluate their approaches to teaching and learning (Hodges et al., 2020; Kok, 2010).

Institutions have recognized the importance of providing faculty with training and professional development opportunities to effectively integrate technology into their teaching methods. This proactive approach acknowledges that successful implementation of blended learning relies on educators' proficiency in utilizing digital tools and adapting their instructional strategies (Graham et al., 2013; Johnson et al., 2018). Faculty training programs aim to address the technological skills gap and empower educators to create engaging, technology-enhanced learning environments.

The changing expectations of students, who often prefer flexible learning options and access to digital resources, have influenced institutions to explore blended learning models. This shift is driven by the recognition that modern students, accustomed to digital technologies in various aspects of their lives, seek educational experiences that align with their preferences for flexibility and technology integration (Garrison & Vaughan, 2008; Zia et al., 2023). The adoption of blended learning seems to respond to these evolving student expectations, providing a dynamic and accessible learning environment.

In some countries, government policies and initiatives have encouraged or mandated the adoption of blended learning in higher education. Recognizing the transformative potential of blended learning, governments have implemented strategic policies to promote its integration into the educational landscape (Zia et al., 2023). These initiatives aim to enhance the quality of education, improve accessibility, and align academic practices with the demands of the digital era. As a result, higher education institutions in these countries are compelled to embrace blended learning

as part of a broader commitment to educational innovation and advancement (Johnson et al., 2018; Welker & Berardino, 2005).

Despite progress, challenges such as resistance to change, lack of resources, and concerns about maintaining educational quality continue to impact the widespread adoption of blended learning.

6. CONCLUSION

In conclusion, the successful integration of blended learning in higher education settings faces multifaceted challenges that demand careful consideration and strategic planning. Faculty and staff resistance, rooted in a preference for traditional teaching methods, poses a significant obstacle to the seamless adoption of blended learning. This cultural resistance within institutions underscores the need for comprehensive faculty development programs that not only enhance technological skills but also foster a positive attitude toward innovative pedagogical approaches.

Moreover, the inadequate technology infrastructure, characterized by issues such as insufficient Wi-Fi coverage and outdated hardware, impedes the effective implementation of blended learning. Addressing these infrastructure shortcomings requires a substantial investment in upgrading technological resources to ensure a conducive environment for both educators and students.

The challenges extend to educators' preparedness, as many may lack the essential skills and training needed to leverage technology effectively. Ongoing professional development programs become imperative to keep faculty abreast of the latest tools and methodologies, thereby enhancing their capacity to deliver quality blended learning experiences.

Adapting existing courses to a blended format is a time-consuming process that necessitates significant effort from faculty members. Redesigning curriculum, creating digital content, and rethinking assessment strategies require institutional support and recognition of the additional workload associated with this transition.

On the student front, a potential lack of preparedness for the shift to blended learning may manifest in insufficient digital literacy skills. To address this, educational institutions must proactively provide support and resources to ensure equitable learning experiences for all students, considering variations in technology access and connectivity.

Ensuring the quality of education in a blended learning environment is pivotal. Institutions must allocate resources, both financial and human, for the development and maintenance of online platforms, training programs, and technical support. Assessing and evaluating student performance in this new paradigm further demands a reconsideration of traditional assessment methods and the development of innovative approaches.

The absence of standardized practices and guidelines for blended learning, coupled with concerns regarding data security, privacy, and the long-term sustainability of initiatives, underscores the need for a holistic institutional approach. To overcome these challenges, collaborative efforts encompassing faculty development, infrastructure investment, and strategic planning are essential for fostering a technologically advanced and student-centric higher education landscape.

REFERENCES

- Alebaikan, R. A. (2010). *Perceptions of blended learning in saudi universities*. Unpublished Ph.D thesis, University Exeter, City of Exeter. https://ore.exeter.ac.uk/repository/bitstream/handle/10036/117486/AlebaikanR_fm.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y
- Aydemir, F., & Saralar-Aras, İ. (2021, October 26-28). The effect of traditional and innovative learning environments, pedagogy and technologies on academic achievement of 5th grade students in mathematics: A quasi-experimental study. Paper presented at *the 14th International Computer and Instructional Technologies Symposium*. Rize, Turkey & Online, ICITS.
- Clark, R. C., & Mayer, R. E. (2023). *E-learning and the science of instruction: Proven guidelines for consumers and designers of multimedia learning*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Creswell, J. W. (2013). *Educational research planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research* (4th ed.). Pearson Education.
- Garrison, D. R., & Vaughan, N. D. (2008). *Blended learning in higher education: framework, principles, and guidelines*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Graham, C. R., Woodfield, W., & Harrison, J. B. (2013). A framework for institutional adoption and implementation of blended learning in higher education. *The Internet And Higher Education*, 18, 4-14. <https://doiorg/10.1016/j.iheduc.2012.09.003>
- Hentea, M., Dhillon, H. S., & Dhillon, M. (2006). Towards changes in information security education. *Journal of Information Technology Education: Research*, 5(1), 221-233. <https://www.learntechlib.org/p/111542/?nl=1>
- Johnson, E., Morwane, R., Dada, S., Pretorius, G., & Lotriet, M. (2018). Adult learners' perspectives on their engagement in a hybrid learning postgraduate programme. *The Journal of Continuing Higher Education*, 66(2), 88-105. <https://doi.org/10.1080/07377363.2018.1469071>
- King, S. H., & Arnold, K. C. (2009). Blended learning environments in higher education: a case study of how professors make it happen. *Journal of Mid-Western Educational Researcher*, 25(1-2), 44-59. <https://www.mwera.org/MWER/volumes/v25/issue1-2/v25n1-2-King-Arnold-GRADUATE-STUDENT-SECTION.pdf>
- Kistow, B. (2011). Blended learning in higher education: A study of a graduate school of business, Trinidad and Tobago. *Journal of Caribbean Teaching Scholar*, 1(2), 115-128. <https://journals.sta.uwi.edu/ojs/index.php/cts/article/view/12/9>
- Kok, A. (2010). From fundamentalists to structuralists: bridging the digital divide. *International Journal of Educational Technology*, 7(3), 1-12. <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1098374.pdf>
- Morgan, K. R. (2002). *Blended learning: A strategic action plan for a new campus*. Seminole: University of Central Florida.
- Nawaz, A., Awan, Z., & Ahmad, B. (2004). Integrating technology in higher education: Challenges and opportunities in developing countries. *Journal of Education and Practice*. <https://core.ac.uk/reader/234633140>
- Qureshi, A. N. (2012). Challenges of implementing e-learning in a Pakistani university. *Knowledge Management & E-Learning: An International Journal*, 4(3), 310-324. <https://doi.org/10.34105/j.kmel.2012.04.025>
- Singh, H. (2003). Building effective blended learning programs. *Educational Technology*, 43(6), 51-54. <https://teachingresources.stanford.edu/resources/building-effective-blended-learning-programs-2003/>
- Tshabalala, M.G., Ndeya-Ndereya, C.N., & Merwe, T.V. (2014). Implementing blended learning at a developing university: Obstacles in the way. *Electronic Journal of e-Learning*, 12, 101-110. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/287527573_Implementing_blended_learning_at_a_developing_university_Obstacles_in_the_way

-
- Welker, J., & Berardino, L. (2005). Blended learning: Understanding the middle ground between traditional classroom and fully online instruction. *Journal of Educational Technology Systems*, 34(1), 33-55, <https://doi.org/10.2190/67FX-B7P8-PYUX-TDUP>
- Young, J. R. (2002). 'Hybrid' teaching seeks to end the divide between traditional and online instructions. *The Chronicle of Higher Education*, 48(28), 33. <https://www.chronicle.com/article/hybrid-teaching-seeks-to-end-the-divide-between-traditional-and-online-instruction/>
- Zia, T., Bangfan, L., Khokhar, M. F., & Sharif, M. (2023). Higher education policy in pakistan, challenges and opportunities in global context. *Journal of Education and Educational Development*, 8(2), 208-218. <https://doi.org/10.1234/re.v8.i2.10>